

The Dramaturgy of Religious Emotions in Bach's Cantatas: Aristotelian Processes in Neoplatonic Frames

RUTH HACOHEN

The following article aims to provide an historically-based methodological framework for the interpretation of Bach's dramatic works, especially, but not solely, the religious ones. The proposed conflation of Aristotelian and Neoplatonic aesthetic legacies is argued in terms of their embeddedness in the musico-aesthetic culture under discussion. The analytical categories these legacies yield—including those of affect, mood, protagonist, action, governing idea and unifying form—are further developed in terms of subsequent aesthetic theories which were conceived as heirs to the German line of thought of this aesthetic lore, especially those of Dilthey and Heidegger. These categories will be broken down into certain semiotic components (such as speech act, gesture, agents and modes of connectivity) and developed in reference to relevant musico-stylistic terms.

This apparatus is fashioned, however, not for the sake of indulging in a minute analysis of separate phrases and movements, but rather for promoting an overall understanding of their dramatic flow and the possible experiential effect they are designed to elicit. Two pivotal works in the composer's *oeuvre* have been selected for analysis through this approach: Bach's apparently earliest cantata (BWV 131) of 1707 and his later *Easter Oratorio* or (BWV 245) of 1725/1738. As each of these works conforms to different sets of dramatic constraints and objectives, they may attest to two major dramaturgical strategies in Bach's dramatic enterprise.

Dramaturgy, when applied to Bach's vocal religious compositions, raises a major question, that is to say whether works intended for religious ritual and worship can be gauged in terms similar to those of fictional stage events. A framing of the query in such terms presupposes, of course, that drama and dramaturgy concern the formation of well-made fictional worlds, whose ontological status is at least one step removed from the world of our daily reality. Entertaining the premisses of such fictional worlds usually calls for some 'willing suspension of disbelief', however complicated and uneven such suspension might be. Yet, to presuppose that a religious world is ontologically weaker than our mundane one, or that the ingress into its marvellous domain requires one's suspension of disbelief as to its reality

value, must be conceived, in religious terms, as sheer blasphemy. But if ontological *difference*, rather than rank, is considered, and the call is to *enhance* one's belief in that which religiously transpires (while dismissing the usual daily skepticism regarding, say, supernaturalism and miracles), then the difference between a well-made fictional world and a well-enacted religious one is perhaps not so significant.

Phenomenologically speaking, both 'suspension of disbelief' and 'enhancing of belief' comprise a leap, a migration of consciousness to a sphere different from the ordinary. Such migrations may seem natural to theatre-, cinema-, and opera-goers, and, at least declaratively, are self-evident for worshippers. But as we are told by philosophers, psychologists and theologians, these migrations involve rather complicated performative and cognitive operations. Candice Walton, for one, proposed that for entering and maintaining a make-believe world one is usually assisted by prompts and props, such as stage and screen, frame and perspective, a darkened hall or a mesmerising voice.¹ Depending on the illusive beliefs they are meant to elicit, artistic media, styles and genres differ in these respects.² In the religious realm, Franz Rosenzweig pinpoints the spatial and musico-ritualistic components that tune church-goers into a mode befitting the liturgical event and worship.³ His analysis dwells on the extent to which available artistic forms facilitate the desired absorption into a communal-religious mode of experience.

Performative actions are usually well-defined in time: both the 'real time' of the performative event and the fictional—or ritual—one which it embodies. Once the suspension (or enhancement) occurs, I argue, these actions are perceived as being carried out by personae incorporating 'two bodies': their actual, mundane one and the virtual one they hypostatise (Oedipus, Jesus, or priests as representatives of a deity).⁴ Their concatenated virtual actions are further subsumed by a unifying meaning (or affect) such as tragic, sentimental, lamentative or festal. These, in turn, induce the desirable cognitive-psychic effects (cathartic, alienated,⁵ penitential, and so forth) on the side of spectators (or believers) depending on the style, genre, occasion, norms and authority of authors or religious leaders.

¹ See Candice L. Walton, *Mimesis as Make-Believe: On the Foundations of the Representational Arts* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1990,) pp. 35-43, 63-9. For the problematic of maintaining a 'world' and for its intricate non-verisimilar truth value see respectively Nicholas Wolterstorff, *Works and Worlds of Art* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1980), pp. 114-23 and Michael Riffaterre, *Fictional Truth* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1990).

² I borrow the term 'illusive belief' from the eighteenth-century Aristotelian Thomas Twining, who elaborated his elegant theory of modes of mimesis and make-believe in the two dissertations prefacing his famous translation of Aristotle's *Poetics*. See Thomas Twining, 'from *Two Dissertations...*', in *The Arts in Mind, Pioneering Texts of a Coterie of British Men of Letters*, eds. Ruth Katz and Ruth HaCohen (New Brunswick: Transaction, 2003), pp. 325-68, here 347.

³ See Franz Rosenzweig, *Der Stern der Erlösung* (Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, 1988 [originally 1930]), pp. 392-404.

⁴ The idea of the 'two bodies' draws on Ernst H. Kantorowicz's famous study, *The King's Two Bodies: A Study in Mediaeval Political Theology* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1970 c1957). For the perpetuation of this 'imaginary', as Yaron Ezrahi defines it, in the socio-political European culture, see Yaron Ezrahi, *Necessary Fictions: Imagining Democracy After Modernity* (forthcoming).

⁵ I.e., 'verfremdet', as Bertold Brecht would have it.

If this analysis makes sense, that is, if epistemology proves more consequential than ontology for the understanding of religious works qua experiential worlds, then it could account for the fact that in Bach's cantatas and oratorios aesthetic historical categories drawn from both Aristotelian and Platonic – and its subsequent Neoplatonic – frames of reference could not only coexist peacefully but even reinforce each other. Notwithstanding Plato's (in)famous dismissal of certain artistic elements from his ideal state, in the historical moment which concerns us here, both paradigms of thought were embracing the world of art, seeking its sublime effects on individuals and collectives. As basically contesting paradigms, however, their partial convergence depended on overcoming certain incompatibilities. Music, no doubt, was conducive to their union, bringing to the fore certain mental and structural continuities endorsed by this partnership. These continuities concern both the emotional dimension of music and its affinity with abstract ideas.

Let me briefly discuss each partner's endowment in this match: within Aristotle's *oeuvre*, it is the *Poetics* that had exerted considerable influence on European artistic theory and practice since its translation into Latin in 1498 (the *Rhetoric* is also of importance in this history, but will concern us less here). Though the treatise focused mainly on tragic theatre, the principles it highlighted reinforced the general mimetic trend that was adopted in Western Europe since the early Renaissance in both Poetry and Painting.⁶ However belated was music's entrance into this trend, a 'sisterhood' among the three arts was soon established.⁷ In the spirit of the *Poetics*, all three sisters aimed to present mimetic action through protagonists the audience would sympathise with, aspiring to convey general human significance that would further bring about the desired emotional reaction in readers/ spectators/ listeners. Such emotional reaction was conceived in terms akin to Aristotle's 'fear and compassion' (φόβος and ἔλεος) and was meant to instigate, in turn, a cathartic effect. Once music embarked on this journey, musicians and music theorists, relying on various sources, were quick to recognise its special power to move the 'passions of the mind' through dramatically heightened musical speech. Performed drama was the model for their enterprise, pragmatically, no less than theoretically: even before entire plots were musically staged, the spoken theatre became the arena from which to draw the principles regarding musical emotivity, at least for a Vincenzo Galilei (1581).⁸

⁶ See Bernard Weinberg, *A History of Literary Criticism in the Italian Renaissance* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961). For a broader perspective, see Moshe Barasch, *Theories of Art, 1: from Plato to Winckelmann* (New York: New York University Press, 1985), and Rafeq Habib, *A History of Literary Criticism: From Plato to the Present*, revised edn. (Oxford: Blackwell, 2005), pp. 239-266.

⁷ On how these arts became allied, see Paul O. Kristeller, 'The Modern System of the Arts', in *Renaissance Thought and the Arts* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1965), pp. 163-227; on music's special share in the process, in relation to its introduction into both poetics and the *trivium* already during the sixteenth century, see Claude V. Palisca, *Humanism in Italian Renaissance Musical Thought* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985), pp. 333-433.

⁸ See Vincenzo Galilei, 'Dialogo della musica antica et della moderna' (extracts), *Source Readings in Music History*, ed. Oliver Strunk, vol. 2: *The Renaissance* (London: Faber and Faber, 1981 [originally 1950]), p. 128.

The *stile rappresentativo*, the major musical invention yielded by this revolution, endangered musical holism— a hallmark of the long-standing Platonic and Neoplatonic aesthetic predominance in Christian musical culture. From the point of view of mimetic aesthetics, however, the new emotional musical language that was soon to evolve from these heightened vocal inflections could also be mobilised to boost religiosity. The new imitative power of the *stile rappresentativo* functioned in a similar way as did linear perspective, foreshortening and gesture in, say, a Matthias Grunewald spiritual painting (in the older German tradition) or in the realistic modelling of a Bernini devotional sculpture (in the contemporary Catholic Reformist culture). Their chosen mimetic techniques all aimed at animated spirituality. Certainly, this musical language had to be suitably framed and adjusted to desirable religious contents, ignoring or eclipsing its secularised origins in music drama and related genres.⁹

In the Protestant countries, such musical animism could acquire a special spiritual role. If religious paintings on altar panels or church walls had formerly functioned as props for ushering one into an imaginary religious world, in the aftermath of Protestant iconoclasm dramatic music could serve as a powerful substitute. Indeed, the favourable adoption, in the course of the seventeenth century, of genres such as the sacred concerto and church cantata, along with their dramatic and emotional devices, bespeaks such a trend. With the operatic activity which spread out in German cities towards the end of the seventeenth century, religious music became increasingly Aristotelian even if its users seldom acknowledged the ‘prose’ they were speaking.

If dramatic emotionality became acceptable in the ecclesiastic genres it is because the desirable spiritual content had been ever sanctioned. Neoplatonism played an important role in this respect. Introducing it to the theory of art in the late Renaissance,¹⁰ its Italian adherents (Ludovico Dolce, Giovanni Paolo Lomazzo among others) capsized the original Platonic conception that art is thrice removed from eternal ideas, along with its corollary that art-works are ontologically valueless and epistemologically deceptive. Ideas are preordained, they argued, emanating in stages to the material world. The artist—a creator— experiences this process in the incarnation of mental forms in sensible configurations. Despite its materiality, the Neoplatonists maintained, a work of art thus conceived reflects its parenting idea more purely and ideally than the idea’s embodiments in nature, transcending verisimilitude. This conception had its imprint on various seventeenth-century trends, extending from Jesuit circles to the Cambridge Platonists. It also nourished major Lutheran figures, whose

⁹ A fascinating case in point is the criticism on Palestrina’s *Song of Songs* madrigal cycle—by the officiating pope and other authorities—as verging on the profane: see Ariel Paul, ‘Is Dorian really Dorian? The Song of Songs cycle of motets by Palestrina as a test case for modal theory in the sixteenth century’, unpubl. M.A. thesis, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 2006.

¹⁰ Pico della Mirandola and Marsilio Ficino are considered among the early Renaissance Neoplatonists; the theoretical writing, however, was less concerned with mimesis. With the so-called mannerist orientation in the late Cinquecento, attempts were made to adapt this general theory of beauty to theories of art, as did Lomazzo. See Erwin Panofsky, *Idea: A Concept in Art Theory*, trans. Joseph J. S. Peake, 2nd edn (New York: Harper & Row, 1968), pp. 93-99. See also Barasch, *Theories of Art* (n. 6 above), pp. 196-202.

impact on artistic milieux was not negligible, starting from the humanist reformer Philipp Melanchthon (1497-1560), through the mystic Jakob Böhme (1575-1624) to the philosopher and aesthetician Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph von Schelling (1775-1854).

Music shared a special affinity with Neoplatonism, holding the key to what was, for millennia, conceived as the loftiest ideas of all: world harmony. In the migration of this idea from its Greek Pythagorean-Platonic sources to its Christian destiny, it assumed certain Neoplatonic overtones that surfaced in various subsequent contexts. These overtones concerned, among other notions, a Neoplatonic descending-ascending metaphysical movement (vital for the eventual occult trends of the Renaissance), the idea of musical sympathy ruling throughout the universe, as well as that of harmony that arises out of conflict.¹¹ (Note the dynamic, if not dramatic qualities these ideas introduced into the Platonic lore). Of the many ramifications of these ideas, the contribution of St Ambrose, who argued that not only well-tempered music, but also the community that duly performs it, become harmonious, is of major importance.¹² Though the ways to embody metaphysical harmoniousness in musical practice and theory, whether quantitative or qualitative, varied from style to style and from one theorist to another, this overriding paradigm had a lasting and inclusive influence on European music culture, at least up until Zarlino-Galilei's famous debate, which revealed some of its underlying fractures. With the 'Untuning of the Sky', when physics no longer supported Pythagorean metaphysics, music seemed to lose once and for all its elevated place in the hierarchy of knowledge, and, as occurred in England or France, had to fight in order to secure an elevated cultural position.¹³ In Germany, despite, say, Kepler's unwitting scientific blow to the surviving aspects of cosmic music theory, the art of well-proportioned sounds never quite lost its transcendental status (take Leibniz as an example).¹⁴ There are several possible reasons for this state of affairs, of which Luther's equation of music with theology – which he applied to both his educational system and to

¹¹ For these ideas see Plotinus, *Enneads* III 2, 16-18; IV 4, 41. The harmony arising out of conflict, Plotinus insisted, is of the kind typifying drama, accounting for the evil element in the world.

¹² See Leo Spitzer, *Classical and Christian Ideas of World Harmony* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1963), pp. 23-33.

¹³ John Hollander, in his *The Untuning of the Sky* (New York: Norton, 1961), discusses the transformation of this metaphysical tradition in British thought into poetical commonplace. On the scientific aspect of this revolution see Penelope Gouk, *Music Science and Natural Magic in Seventeenth-Century England* (New Haven: Yale University 1999). For the profanation of music in Britain see, for example, Richard Leppert, *Music and Image: Domesticity, Ideology and Socio-Cultural Formation in Eighteenth-Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1993). Regarding the French, this tendency can be illustrated by the musical writings from Descartes through Mersenne to Rameau. For the cultural underpinning relevant for the French, see Ruth Katz and Ruth HaCohen, *Tuning the Mind: Connecting Aesthetics to Cognitive Science* (New Brunswick: Transaction, 2003), pp. 243-54.

¹⁴ See Ruth Katz and Carl Dahlhaus, *Contemplating Music: Source Readings in the Aesthetics of Music*, vol. 3: *Essence* (New York: Pendragon Press, 1992), pp. 425-57; John Butt, "'A Mind Unconscious that It Is Calculating'": Bach and the Rationalist Philosophy of Wolff, Leibniz and Spinoza', *The Cambridge Companion of Bach*, ed. John Butt (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 60-71.

the innovative liturgical practices he introduced – is of prime importance.¹⁵ This equation became deeply entrenched in German culture, as evident, for example, in Dilthey's assessment that 'Luther and Schleiermacher, our two great theologians, realised that music is the closest system to religion, and that listening to music, when this is true music, is a religious act'. Bach, in this scheme, acts as a meridian connecting these two theological giants and inspiring many other religious souls, Christian and otherwise.¹⁶

Top-down Platonic processes and bottom-up Aristotelian ones coalesced with regard to music, especially the Lutheran one, in a special way, reinforcing the mental dispositions each of these traditions separately enhanced.¹⁷ The Lutheran conception of community as an aggregate of individuals (even if predestined rather than free-willed) was bolstered by subsequent political and social developments that emphasised each person's interiority, acknowledging its unique role in the formation of a collective whole.¹⁸ The rise of emotional consciousness, of *passions de l'âme* as cultural entities, whether Cartesian or otherwise, contributed its part to this new social imaginary. The increasing tendency among composers of dramatic genres, later in the seventeenth century, to render sonically such emotional states, especially in the framework of the motivically elaborated aria, contributed its share to the ontologisation of passions as social categories.¹⁹ Not only does the passion, capable of being sung, become a self-sufficient category, but as performed presence it was hypostatized as an entity possessing duration, logic and nuances of its own. Aimed to faithfully reflect the individual's soul, the passions were concomitantly presented as tokens for successful emotional communication with the self as well as with intimate and more distant dramatic fellows. At the same time, by virtue of their poetic sublimity and musical cohesion, these innovative expressive procedures evoked aesthetic loftiness, akin to Neoplatonic ideas. These forms and procedures sometimes gave rise to a classification of modes of expression in terms of diverse

¹⁵ See Katz and HaCohen, *Tuning the Mind* (n. 13 above), pp. 254-56.

¹⁶ As quoted in Rudolf A. Makkreel, *Dilthey: Philosopher of the Human Studies*, 3rd edn (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992), p. 366. In respect to Bach, Dilthey says: 'The core of Lutheran religiosity is the inner conflict in the soul of the individual person. The motets and cantatas of Bach constitute the highest expression that this Lutheran congregational consciousness has ever found' (*ibid.*, p. 367). On the special status of Bach's music in this connection see also Ruth HaCohen, 'Between Noise and Harmony: The Oratorical Moment in the Musical Entanglements of Jews and Christians', *Critical Inquiry* 32/2 (Winter 2006), 250-77.

¹⁷ For an earlier coalescing of these traditions, starting with Ficino, see Daniel P. Walker, *Spiritual and Demonic Magic from Ficino to Campanella* (London: Warburg Institute, 1958), pp. 3-74. For later ramifications, see Gary Tomlinson, *Music in Renaissance Magic: Towards a Historiography of Others* (Chicago: Chicago University Press 1993), pp. 196-98; 212-16.

¹⁸ On German individualism and its Lutheran roots, see Louis Dumont, *German ideology: From France to Germany and Back* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994), pp. 6-11. See also Yaron Ezrahi, *Necessary Fictions: Democracy after Modernity*, ch. 9; in relation to music and Bach in particular see John Butt, *Bach's Dialogue with Modernity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010).

¹⁹ For a succinct history of this development, see Reinhard Strohm, 'Aria and Recitative from the Beginnings to the Nineteenth Century', *Encyclopedia della Musica*, vol. 4, ed. Jean-Jacques Nattiez et al. (Turin: Einaudi, 2004), pp. 416-29.

emotional categories, recognised and analysed by both contemporary and modern theorists and scholars.

That dramatic music also facilitates the formation of collective, in addition to individual or dialogical, psychic states, has been less frequently diagnosed in the emotionality – the opera seria – was almost bereft of the incorporated voices of the many. In the Platonic/Neoplatonic tradition, such collective emotional states are known as moods, or *Stimmungen*; they are associated with what music relevant literature. This is partly because the arena for elaborating musicalised inspires through its unified unfolding in a *shared* audial space. Leo Spitzer sensitised us to the striking etymological connection of mood and mode, *Stimmung* and *Stimme*, voice, tune and tuning (of the soul) - although the close association of music to *Stimmung* was acknowledged earlier in the aesthetic tradition.²⁰ Unlike the undulating nature of individual emotion, mood is often characterised as a steadier mental state that can be easily recognised as such and shared by many. The etymological connection of mode and mood thus marks a basic intuition, namely, of the role of prevailing musical qualities such as mode, but also meter, tempo, orchestration and a predominant texture in defining mood.²¹ The question of whether one can practically distinguish emotionally individualised musical pieces from musically embodied moods bears significant hermeneutic implications and needs some elaboration before we continue.

Mood or *Stimmung*: This elaboration is offered here through a rather simplified version of ideas advocated by two major German thinkers, not unrelated to the aesthetic legacies delineated above: Martin Heidegger and Wilhelm Dilthey. For Heidegger, moods or *Stimmungen* are prime factors in human existence, itself ever qualified by its 'thereness' (*Dasein*), i.e. by all that which occurs and contextually characterises – historically, socially, culturally, etc. – a certain life. For Heidegger, mood is more than an experiential colour; it is the basic quality of being, conveying the significance of a particular state of affairs to the person who happens to be 'thrown into' it. Mood is thus prior to all 'cognition or volition'; it is neither interior nor individualistic but rather a direct reflection of a lived moment through the participation in a communal whole. It is, as its etymology instructs, a particular tuning into the world of human activities.

Through moods (sometimes termed: *Gestimmtsein*), Heidegger thus attempted to transcend the conventional divisions between the objective and the subjective which he deemed erroneous, thus rejecting the notion of introspective emotionalism. Instead, by viewing 'moods' as disclosers of the 'raw givenness of our life' as well as the specific nature of our context as totality (as Guignon points

²⁰ For Dilthey's use of the term in connection with music, see Makkreel, *Dilthey* (n. 16 above), pp. 364-70. Kant's linking of *Stimmung* and *Stimme* is also of interest in this context; see Thomas Pfau, *Romantic Moods: Paranoia, Trauma, and Melancholy, 1790-1840* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 2005), pp. 33-45.

²¹ See also Gustav Theodor Fechner, 'Vorschule der Aesthetik' (excerpt) in *Music in European Thought, 1851-1912*, ed. Bojan Bujic (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), p. 285. This understanding is later shared by theorists such as Leonard B. Meyer in *Emotion and Meaning in Music* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956), p. 6.

out), Heidegger also granted them the role of orientation-givers.²² As such, moods are ever-shifting and always attuned to 'public forms of life'. While partaking in general moods, particular occurrences of 'emotions' are considered as limited choices possible within existential routes preordained by society. Their occurrences may grant identity but may also lead to anxiety over one's unique existence within what is recognised as naked (or 'Anyone's') existence.

Bypassing emotional individualism and its underlying epistemological premisses, Heidegger rejected Dilthey's ideas of the inner growth of a biographical subject. Indeed, Dilthey's phenomenological anthropology resides within the precepts of *Bildung*, viewing the 'acquired psychic nexus' of an individual as an ongoing conscious process to bridge experience (*Erlebnis*) and image, private and collective, subjective and objective mental forms. Dilthey's musical metaphor thus goes beyond the Heideggerian attunement to the idea of inner life experienced as the unfolding of a melodic whole, ever in a process of becoming: an 'objective' presence subjectively felt. In terms of cultural development, Dilthey would similarly recognise the transfiguration of communal form to more personal religious poetry and music as a prime achievement. Even more emphatically than in his afore-quoted words, Dilthey would argue that the supreme embodiment of Protestant consciousness is to be found in J. S. Bach's music rather than in Luther's writings. 'The core of Lutheran religiosity', writes Dilthey, 'is the inner conflict in the soul of the individual person. The motets and cantatas of Bach constitute the highest expression that this Lutheran congregational consciousness has ever found'.²³ In words borrowed from more recent discourse, an individual who belongs to such an imagined whole can 'work through' its internal conflicts to achieve an intersubjective validity and strength.²⁴ Put somewhat differently, in Bach's religious works *Stimmung* and affect become interrelated in a special way unknown in parallel Italian genres that sought highly nuanced individual expression while ignoring its abiding interlacing with collective moods. That the communal-artistic conditions that characterised Bach's historical world comprised a rare condition for imaginative projection of such experiential processes is a claim which requires further verification.²⁵

Having entered into the shared aural space of Bach's dramatico-ritualistic world, we can now address the critical questions listed below to the works

²² Charles Guignon, 'Moods in Heidegger's "Being and Time"', *What is an Emotion? Classic and Contemporary Readings*, ed. Robert C. Solomon, 2nd edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press 2003), pp. 181-90.

²³ In Dilthey, *Von deutscher Dichtung and Musik*, p. 217, as quoted in Makkreel (n. 16 above), p. 367.

²⁴ Ever since the birth of modern dramatic music, composers acknowledged the possibility of such individualised expression, especially when they assigned to personae experiencing the same event different emotional reactions. The opera seria is a prime example in this respect. Four different personae witness the decapitated head of Pompey in Handel's *Giulio Cesare*: Caesar, Cornelia (his widow), his son, and an opportunist officer; each will react according to the particular impact this vision imprints on their lives and futures.

²⁵ Butt in *Bach's Dialogue with Modernity* (n. 18 above) makes strong claim in similar direction.

themselves. These questions derive from the above-mentioned direct or indirect elaborations of the Aristotelian notions of psycho-dramatic 'processes' on the one hand and Neoplatonic 'givens' on the other:

1. *Enhancement of belief (willingly or unwillingly)*: which props are provided in order to promote the listener-believer's initial 'enhancement of belief'? How is the sense of the 'real', of the world constituted by the work, maintained throughout its unfolding, and to what extent are these means unique to Bach's works?
2. *Platonic/ Aristotelian conception of overriding idea*: is the overriding idea of the work/ world under discussion discernable and well-embodied? Does it emerge, transfigure, or is it explicitly brought to the fore in its course and remains steady throughout?
3. *Emotional entities*: can we differentiate within the work/world between expressions of individualised emotions and emotions of individuals, and can we further connect them to the unfolding of theological, religious ideas and 'sacred history'?
4. *Collective moods*: how do such individual emotions relate to collective *Stimmungen*, if at all; do they contrast with them, are generated from them, or lead towards them? Which of the two types is given priority?
5. *From affects to effect*: can we establish the overall effect or experience (cathartic, consolatory, penitential) the work seeks to elicit through the succession of affects and moods; how does such an effect relate to the overriding religio-theological idea? Does the work reflect a progressive and intersubjective 'psychic nexus' of the implied persona or a more generalised enveloping mood?

However detailed these questions may seem, they lack an analytical edge that would bring us to the work as *performed* entity. For this purpose, I chose to elaborate here on a semiotic terminology I developed for use in particular connection with Bach's Passions,²⁶ now bearing the following interrelated terms:

- 1) **speech acts** (as textual units) entailed in the poetical text: their kinds, force, frequency and performative nature;
- 2) **musical gestures** which embody them: their expressive distinction, dialogical potential and motivic proliferation and variability;
- 3) **dramatis personae** (abstract or specific, real or virtual)²⁷ as embodied agencies of such speech acts/ gestures: the extent to which they are dramatically characterised and maintained throughout the work;

²⁶ Ruth HaCohen, 'Fictional Planes and Their Interplay: The Alchemy of Forms and Emotions in the St Matthew Passion', *Music and Signs: Semiotic and Cognitive Studies in Music*, ed. Ioannis Zannos (Bratislava: Asco Art and Sciences, 1999), pp. 416-34.

²⁷ I borrow the term 'virtual persona' from Edward T. Cone, who coined it to address the instrumental parts in dramatic/expressive music. See Edward T. Cone, *The Composer's Voice* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1974).

4) **emotional entities** they project or are engulfed in: the genre or subgenre that defines them, conveying whether an affect is being presented or a mood is circumscribed and their relation to it;

5) **Dasein-planes** which they inhabit. (A *Dasein*-plane in a dramatic work connects those who happen to share—fictionally, theologically or historically—the same existential space. The biblical figures in the Passions belong to one, whereas the reflective souls belong to another; the choral groups may relate to a third and more mundane one, and so on). Defying Aristotelian unities, ‘Neoplatonic dialogues’ between planes can occur (as they do in certain genres of religious painting, when celestial beings converse with human beings, from ‘above’), drawing on music as a shared communicative duration;

6) **modes of connectivity** which link the appearances of *personae* or planes to each other. Such modes can be dialogical (when *personae* happen to entertain the same musical plateau, as in the duet ‘Komm, mein Jesu’ in cantata BWV 21, ‘Ich hatte viel Bekümmernis’); recursive (when independent units are concatenated through ‘nesting’ tonal relations); symmetrical (when movements are ordered so as to highlight their affinities, as in BWV 131 and other early cantatas); overlapping or intervening (when breaking into another’s plane as in St Matthew Passion no. 27, in which a chorus crying ‘Lass’ ihn, haltet, bindet nicht’ breaks into the double aria ‘So ist mein Jesus nun gefangen’).

Supposing that we are now well-equipped to enter into one of Bach’s dramatico-ritualistic worlds and to analyse its principal strategies, let us first delve into cantata BWV 131, ‘Aus der Tiefen rufe ich, Herr, zu dir’.

This 1707 cantata, apparently the first one Bach composed (for the Blasius Church in Mühlhausen), and definitely the first whose autograph has come down to us, draws on the entire Psalm 130, to which some poetry was added, probably by the (competing) St. Mary Church’s archdeacon Peter Eilmar, who was on friendly terms with the young composer.²⁸ An overriding idea is rather straightforwardly granted by the psalm itself:

- 1: Aus der Tiefe rufe ich, HERR, zu dir.
- 2: HERR, höre auf meine Stimme, laß deine Ohren merken auf die Stimme meines Flehens!
- 3: So du willst, HERR, Sünden zurechnen, HERR, wer wird bestehen?
- 4: Denn bei dir ist die Vergebung, daß man dich fürchte:
- 5: Ich harre des HERRN; meine Seele harret, und ich hoffe auf sein Wort
- 6: Meine Seele wartet auf den HERRN von einer Morgenwache bis zur andern.
- 7: Israel, hoffe auf den HERRN! denn bei dem HERRN ist die Gnade und viel Erlösung bei ihm,
- 8: Und er wird Israel erlösen aus allen seinen Sünden.

²⁸ Gerhard Herz, ‘BWV 131: Bach’s first cantata’, *Studies in Eighteenth-Century Music: A Tribute to Karl Geiringer on his 70th Birthday*, ed. H. C. Robbins Landon et al. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1970), pp. 272-91, here 274. See *ibid.* for details on the circumstances of the cantatas and the provenance of the autograph. See also Christoph Wolff, *Johann Sebastian Bach: The Learned Musician* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 111-12.

- (1: Out of the depths have I cried unto thee, O LORD.
- 2: Lord, hear my voice: let thine ears be attentive to the voice of my supplications.
- 3: If thou, LORD, shouldest mark iniquities, O LORD, who shall stand?
- 4: But there is forgiveness with thee, that thou mayest be feared.
- 5: I wait for the LORD, my soul doth wait, and in his word do I hope.
- 6: My soul waiteth for the Lord more than they that watch for the morning: I say, more than they that watch for the morning.
- 7: Let Israel hope in the LORD: for with the LORD there is mercy, and with him is plenteous redemption.
- 8: And he shall redeem Israel from all his iniquities.)

The subject throughout most of the psalm, like that of many other psalms, is the lyrical, existential, first-person believer, addressing his God from within his turbulent, agonised state. It is not only 'the indexical I' (the first person singular, 'owned' by those who utter it performatively) that is so persistent here, but also its related verbs and objects, of which those of voice and soul are primary: *rufe ich, Meine Stimme, meine Seele*. From within his or her prayer, ruminations and reflections, he or she undergoes a process leading from despair to hope and reassurance.

This language is unmediated, almost natural, certainly for eighteenth-century Protestant individuals. They could reinvent it; were they, perchance, to be swept onto a lonely island – as befell a certain descendant of a Bremenian merchant, one named Robinson Kreutznaer (better known as Robinson Crusoe) – they would fabricate in their distress speech acts of the kind this solitary soul reportedly did: 'Lord!' he addressed God, 'What a miserable creature am I? If I should be sick, I shall certainly die for want of help; and what will become of me?'²⁹ Later on, seizing a Bible from the wrecked ship, this Crusoe-Kreutznaer upgrades his appeals, drawing on the original words of King David, 'Call on me in the day of trouble, and I will deliver, and thou shalt glorify me'.³⁰

The German-Lutheran background of this famous fictional British fellow, whose story was published in 1719, may indirectly, but rather powerfully, throw light on the young Bach's and his congregation's attraction to psalms.³¹ Also in Bach's case the psalm could refer to a catastrophe, to the great fire, which reportedly had destroyed a large part of Mühlhausen at the end of May 1707. (The work was performed in August that same year). Such a speculation, common in the Bach literature, bespeaks the need to explain the existential source of the powerful leap of belief, from distressing reality to a world of faith that the work seems to offer, not only ideationally, but also experientially.

The psalm ends in the ultimate collective: 'Israel, hoffe auf den HERRN!' (Israel, put your hope in the Lord! This translation is more faithful to the direct speech act of the Hebrew Bible than that of King James). The agent addressing the people in this last verse may be the same individual whose voice we hear throughout the psalm, but now is no longer distinguished as such. Such transitions are ubiquitous in Psalms; the composer, if he seeks a cogent expressive

²⁹ Daniel Defoe, *The Life and Adventures of Robinson Crusoe* (Penguin, 1965), p. 105.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 108.

³¹ The early cantatas based on Psalm verses include BWV 21, 71, 150, 196.

Adagio

Sinfonia. Lente

Music Example 2, BWV 131/1, sinfonia, b. 1- 5

The generic potentiality of such an instrumental prelude was recognised even by an ardent Aristotelian – James Harris, an English aesthete who wrote in 1744 that ‘by the [instrumental] Preludes, the Symphonies and concurrent operation of Music in all its parts’ a desired mood is impressed on listeners, something the poet is able to achieve only with much verbal ado.³³ With regard to the first movement of our cantata, one could say that even before they begin their pleas, the embodied voices are aware of a communal surrounding and attune themselves to it, adding their own affiliated utterances.

There is, however, a difference between the ‘moody’ sinfonia and the gestural speech acts that seem to derive from it. The sinfonia gestures only the eventual ‘Aus der Tiefen’ motif, melodically and tonally, with a middle section on C major (which moves through D minor back to the opening A minor). It leaves the more pronounced ‘rufe’ element to the **dramatis personae**, avoiding declarative cadences and immediate echoing. With its internal hues, it thus shuns drama and emotional plea, making instead the communal *Befindlichkeit* (the Heideggerian ‘being-in-mood’) audible, from which individuals embark on their own religious-emotional journey.

The second verse, again performative, further urges its addressee, the Lord, to listen: ‘HERR, höre meine Stimme!’ (Lord, hear my voice) (see Mus. Ex. 3).

³³ See *The Arts in Mind* (n. 2 above), p. 143.

Oboe

Violin

Viola 1 & 2

Soprano
Alto

Tenore
Basso

Continuo
Organo

Herr, Herr, hoe-re mei-ne Stimme, lass deine Ohren mer-ken auf die Stim-me mei-nes Fle-hens.

Herr.

Herr.

6 6 4 6 6 6 6 # 6 6 6 6 6 7 # # 3 6 4 #

Music Example 3, BWV 131/1, b. 59-63

The metrical and tempo change (from 3/4 to common metre, and from adagio to vivace), and the zigzagging contour of the repeated utterance that breaks in the middle into individualised calls, 'lass' deine Ohren merken auf die Stimme meines Flehens!' (let thine ears be attentive to the voice of my supplications), ending with a musicalised 'Flehen' – all these devices accelerate the illocutions of this host of gradually heightened and well-differentiated supplications.³⁴ The build-up of momentum through various techniques stresses individualised agency as well as emotional intensification: through repetition that is then reduced; through omission – after three times – of the first part of the utterance; through an overlapping polyphony with 'stretto' entries; through a gradual introduction of the top note (A) of the soprano which is then reiterated in close proximity; and, through the arrival into homophonic texture that breaks into a sobbing hoquetus, on 'Flehen'.

The more composed individual persona that arises from this boisterous experience in the second movement (marked *andante*) continues unobtrusively the former musical gesture (deriving from the shortened *Flehen* motif), relaxing

³⁴ Bach was less concerned with 'total counterpoint', as Herz, 'BWV 131' (n. 28 above) indicates (p. 279); this may relate to his urge, at this point of his career, to have first the ideas set forward in the most effective way, which he could achieve later also through more intricate fugal development.

its pace and airing its texture. The oboe responds elatedly and sympathetically, moving to the parallel major. This might startle us, for, heeding the distressed words of verse 3, the uttering individual seems too placid. Where does his calmness stem from? We soon shall learn that theological support, whose existential meaning is enormous, is here experientially provided. A voice utters a supplementary poetry:

Erbarm' Dich mein in solcher Last,
Nimm sie aus meinem Herzen,
Die weil Du sie gebüßet hast,
Am Holz mit Todesschmerzen:
Auf dass ich nicht mit grossem Weh
In meinen Sünden untergeh,
Noch ewiglich verzagete, Dich fürchte.

(Have mercy on me in such grief,
Remove it from my bosom,
Because thou hast now paid for it
On wood with pains of dying,
So that I might with grievous woe
Within my sinful state not die,
Nor give up hope forever.)

God is no longer the fierce entity of the Old Testament, whose judgment terrifies the individual, but the Lord who vicariously bears the iniquities of sinners. The voice, a soprano, seems to descend from another *Dasein-plane*, incarnated in a familiar chorale melody ('Herr Jesu Christ, du höchstes Gut') to strengthen the struggling believer (see Mus. Ex. 4).

Oboe

Soprano

Basso

Continuo Organo

Er - - -

so du_willt, so du_willt, Herr, Suen - de zu - rech - nen, so du_willt, so du_willt

barm dich mein in sol - - - cher Last,

willt, Herr Suen - - - dg zu - rech - nen, so du_willt, so du_willt, Herr Suen - - - de zu - rech - nen,

Music Example 4, BWV 131/2, b. 4 (2nd beat) -11 (2nd beat)

This is the first time Bach uses this vocalised variation on a chorale prelude technique, which he will further develop and make dramatic use of in subsequent vocal works, especially the *Passions*. Also his solution to the mutual arrangement of psalm verse and chorale text—here cast in a bar form— prefigures later arrangements of this kind). Repetitive declarative recitation could thus turn the words ‘dass man dich fürchte’ into a doubly enhanced melismatic lulling, banishing anxiety and paving the way for feelings of hope and relief.

A chorus of individuals thus emerges, encouraged to declare, in large blocks, in the parallel major mode: ‘Ich harre des HERRN’ (I am awaiting the LORD) (see Mus. Ex. 5).

The image shows a musical score for the first five measures of BWV 131/3, marked 'Adagio'. The score is arranged in five systems, each with a different instrument or voice part. The top system is for Oboe and Violino. The second system is for Viola 1&2. The third system is for Soprano and Alto. The fourth system is for Tenore and Basso. The fifth system is for Continuo and Organo. The vocal parts have lyrics: 'Ich har - re des Herrn, ich har - re des Herrn, ich har'. The Continuo and Organo part has a '7 7' marking above it.

Music Example 5, BWV 131/3, b. 1-5

Alternating individual voices respond to it freely and excitedly. Then they all divide again into their autonomous speech acts on 'meine Seele harret, und ich hoffe auf sein Wort' (my soul doth wait, and in his word do I hope), giving vent to their emotional plea in the more elaborate quasi-chromatic melismatic gesture on 'harret', the waiting. Separated from this according to the old motet technique, the second part of the verse expresses the hopeful element through downward leaps, elaborated by the independent instrumental echoing texture of the oboe and the violin. The quasi-fugal texture that opened in G minor ends up in A minor as a tonal sign of progress, to be embodied in the last collective (adagio) declaration. It further relaxes itself through a plagal cadencing, resolved onto a Picardic third (on 'Wort!') and aided by a conspicuous virtual agent: the bassoon.

Moving to **modes of connectivity**, and how they relate both to the overriding idea and subsuming effect, the symmetry of the edifice and the tonal progressions and linkages subsisting in it loom large. In terms of the subgenres in use, a fourth movement, exploiting again a chorale-aria texture with its inter-*Dasein*-plane dialogue, as compared with the chorale melody of the second movement (now of the tenor and alto) and alternating with the polyvocal movements, should not conceal the fact that this symmetry is invested with a forward thrust. The breaking up of the common metre to 12/8 confers, in this case, a feeling of confidence, further stabilised by an opening ostinato in the bass. Hued in pastoral colours, the believer is now waiting for the Lord – as the opening speech acts palpably conveys (b. 4-5) – with contained yet growing excitement (also communicated by the transformation of the ostinato into relentless motions that often evade cadential closure), overcoming former precariousness.

The fifth and last movement absorbs many of the musical elements of the former ones, although there is a shift in nuances towards an overpowering sense

of the community's redemption, which enhances the progressive symmetry of the work. The voice of the individual now merges completely with that of the collective, who sets the mood for itself. S/he is one of many others who may have gone through a similar process and are now sharing the plea 'let Israel hope in the LORD: for with the LORD there is mercy, and with him is plenteous redemption'. This resolves in a reconciliation of Old and New Testaments, for despair and judgment are now transfigured into hope and mercy.

The last movement, reverberating from the impulse of the third, opens with a homophonic declamation, which then breaks into excited, interrelated stretto gestures of individuals (b. 5), sympathetically echoed by the orchestra's virtual agents. The mood is stable, even with the mode alternation (in the opening bars) with its parallel major. Varied speech acts, leading to a permutational fugue and other polyphonic devices, reveal that the spiritual journey has arrived at its final destination. A community has been reconstituted through vocalised emotive gestures that have emphatically arisen, partly even through upward chromatic motions, from bottom up, *aus der Tiefen*.

In the *Easter Oratorio* (BWV 249; last and definitive version dated 1738), a different set of dramatico-religious constraints is revealed. A parody on previous 'secular' works, it challenges us by showing how pre-established 'worldly' moods and full-fledged, emotional expressions moulded within a chorus, recitative and aria da capo formats fit into one of the most sacred moments in the Christian Year. Certainly, Bach is not the first to make such superimpositions; the theology underlying them has determined the *contrafacta* element of Lutheran chorales from the beginning. Tropological and allegorical reading of 'worldly' biblical chapters, even before Protestantism, paved the way to such moves also in music. Bach's parodies, however, bring to the fore an element rather concealed in these important antecedents, to wit: emotions and moods are mental categories broad enough to allow their particular 'occurrences' to meander beyond denominational boundaries, even beyond the religious as such. This condition will receive an aesthetic conceptualisation in the course of the eighteenth century. Defined emotions are verbal labels through which we reify psychosomatic affective undulations, which music excels in simulating or portraying.³⁵ Religious thinking could co-opt even a tenet of this sort (as instantiated in Kierkegaard's thought), but it could not eschew its ecumenical implication.

Emotions evoked in connection with a celebration on behalf of an earthly sovereign are thus of the kind one may cherish in relation to a festival launched in honour of a heavenly one: we may call such emotions triumphant joy, exuberant delight, etc. (see Mus. Ex. 6).

³⁵ The most prominent exponents of this approach are Daniel Webb, in *Observations of the Correspondence between Poetry and Music*, see *The Arts in Mind* (n. 2 above), pp. 259-64; and Johann Jakob Engel, who probably borrowed it from Webb, in his *Über die Musikalische Malerei*, see *Contemplating Music* (n. 14 above), vol. 3, pp. 131-32.

1. Sinfonia

The musical score for the first Sinfonia of BWV 249/1, measures 1-6, is presented in a standard orchestral format. It includes parts for Tromba I, Tromba II & III, Timpani, Oboe I & II, Violin I & II, Viola, and Continuo. The key signature is one sharp (F#) and the time signature is 3/8. The score shows a progression from a more active, rhythmic beginning to a more melodic and sustained texture by measure 6.

Music Example 6, BWV 249/1, b. 1-6

A strain of longing, with touches of melancholy, may fit the mood of prayer, reverence or remembrance of more difficult times endured by the beloved ruler. When the pent-up joy bursts forth again, it might turn into a dominating *Stimmung*, calling a community to join in. This emotional progression from melancholy to joy is, in a nutshell, what transpires in the three opening movements of BWV 249 (*Easter Oratorio*); BWV 249a and BWV 249b, which preceded it, betray a similar progression.³⁶ Curiously, these two basic moods are privileged in Plato's dialogue on the desired music in his ideal Republic.

The emotional journey continues: a general pastoral atmosphere colours the da capo aria of an individual, 'Seele deine Spezereien' (249); 'Hunderttausend Schmeicheleien' (249a), 'Süße, wunderschöne Triebe' (249b) – one overflowing with excited affection towards the object of reverence. The overarching flute melody, in the sharp minor mode, also features in the soprano aria, 'Aus Liebe' in the St Matthew Passion (no. 49), likewise accompanied by woodwind staccato (though there it conforms to the style of the *bassetchen* aria).

The next emotional state, carried by an individual, features relaxation; its object may vary from Arcadian sheep (249a) through Muses and their

³⁶ BWV 249a 'Entfliehet, verschwindet, entweichet, ihr Sorgen', is a shepherds' cantata (1725) composed for the birthday of Duke Christian von Sachsen-Weißenfels; BWV 249b, 'Verjaget, zerstreuet, zerrüttet, ihr Sterne' (1726), was set for the birthday of Count Joachim Friedrich von Flemming. Their reciprocal music is known to be the same as that of BWV 249, which parodied the first cantata poetically and musically. The parallel movements in the three works are, respectively – 3 5 7 9 11, 3 5 7 9 11 and 1 3 5 7 9. For further details, see *NBA*, ser. 2, vol. 7, ed. Paul Brainard (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1981), especially pp. 51-5.

companions on Mount Parnassus (249b) to Jesus himself (249). This relaxation may suggest some sort of overcoming of a previous anxiety; it lulls its hearers largely with waves of dyadic seconds, carried by *flauti dolci* and violins *con sordino* that occasionally stir themselves into more excited steps spanning larger intervals (see Mus. Ex. 7).

7. Aria

Flauto dolce I

Flauto dolce II

Violino I

Violino II
con sordini

Fagotto
Continuo

Music Example 7, BWV 249/7, b. 1-4

Prompting a mood rather than articulating an affect, the section marks an emotional pause for all personae involved, both inside the imaginary world and outside it, from which to further urge the motion toward the adored object of festivity. The urging persona (in the next concerted number) is again an individual, introduced by a concerted ritornello, at once stable and forward-moving, which builds momentum towards a well-prepared apex that ushers in the voice. Whatever its bearer will utter – and s/he definitely expresses concern, asking: ‘where is Jesus (249)? Will the flowers blossom for the occasion (249a)? Will the great day bring happiness to its hero (249b)?’ – the confidence that the anxiety will be resolved for the better is certainly heard through various speech acts (modelled on the ritornello’s gesturing). This concern, however, will give vent to a moment of doubt, almost grief (the B-section of the da capo aria), that seems perhaps exaggerated in the case of the pastoral scene (249a) and that of Parnassus (249b) (see Mus. Ex. 8).

Oboe d'Amore

Violin I

Violin II
Viola

Alto
Komm doch, komm, um-fas - se - mich, denn mein Herz ist - oh - ne dich ganz ver - wai - set

Cello
p

Ob. dam.

Vln. I

Vln. II Vla.

A
und be - truebt, ganz ver - wai - set - und be - truebt

Vc.

Music Example 8, BWV 249/7, b. 48-53

The *Lobgesang* that follows (chorus 'Preis und Dank/ Bleibe, Herr, Dein Lobgesang') is conscious of itself being a song of praise (in all three versions, though called 'Lieder' in 249b) and thus of integrating all participants with fanfares and mirth and jubilation. Merging with the opening parts, it nevertheless enhances the progressive symmetry, effecting its own cathartic release through the various affective moments it stirs and inspires.

This rather schematic description that accounts only for the fully composed parts of the respective works (the recitative sections, with arioso elements, of the secular cantatas cannot be reconstructed from those extant in 249), presumes intermediate dramatic stages that bridge them. They are different for each narrative, unveiling the diverse routes through which one may reach similar psychological states. Thus, although from a compositional point of view the process in BWV 249 originated in a Platonic, top-down process (starting from abstract musical moods and moving towards more concrete emotional expression), its listeners must follow an Aristotelian, bottom-up dramatic unfolding, which renders the elaborated expressions of choruses and arias psychologically cogent.

In other words, dialogical recitatives were composed anew to bridge the drama of individuals having to live up to communal demands: the joyful convention, or conventional joy of an Easter holiday. The overriding idea and its correlated sought-after experience seems to follow a theological-social-emotional predicament, i.e. the transition from mournful *Karfreitag* (Good Friday) to the joy of *Ostern* (Easter), from crucifixion and burial to resurrection and redemption. Individuals, the composer allows us to reflect, cannot simply accommodate themselves into a preordained mood, and run along with everybody to witness the miracle of Jesus's resurrection. The *dramatis personae* here are the scriptural figures of Mary, daughter of James, Mary Magdalene, Peter and John, who gradually perceive that Jesus has risen from his grave and ascended elsewhere.³⁷ The psyche has its own pace, and one should respect it, as musical drama from Monteverdi's *Orfeo* onward has taught the musical world. In this sense, two *Dasein*-planes converge, the scriptural with that of the contemporary congregation.

More broadly assessed, the tensions and convergences between individual souls, seeking their own 'acquired psychic nexus' and collective, partially pre-existing moods became a constant dynamic presence in Bach's religious dramas. This enables biblical and contemporary believers to work through their own unbelief and agony to finally join their collective in mourning and grief, praise and thanks, according to festival and occasion. It also allows other listeners, be they Agnostics, Jews, Muslims or Brahmins, to feel themselves included in such musical pilgrimages which were not originally intended for their foreign ears.

³⁷ A detailed analysis of their various, musicalised speech acts would reveal the ways in which interactive dialogues assist them in this process.